

Equivalent definitions:

Cluster Point of a sequence:

Let $x_n \in \mathbb{R}$, then x is a cluster point of x_n if there is a subsequence x_{n_k} such that $x_{n_k} \rightarrow x$.

Equivalently:

$x \in \mathbb{R}$ is a cluster point if $\forall \epsilon > 0$ and $\forall N > 0 \exists n \geq N$ s.t. $|x_n - x| < \epsilon$.

Note that $x = \infty$ is a cluster point if $\forall M > 0$ and $\forall N > 0 \exists n \geq N$ such that $x_n > M$.

and $x = -\infty$ is a cluster point if $\forall M < 0$ and $\forall N > 0 \exists n \geq N$ such that $x_n < M$.

limit point of a set:

Let $A \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ be a set. Then x is a cluster point of A if there is a sequence $x_n \in A$ such that $x_n \rightarrow x$.

equivalently:

$x \in \mathbb{R}$ is a limit point if $\forall \varepsilon > 0$
 $\exists y \in A$ s.t. $|x - y| < \varepsilon$.

Again the case $x = \infty$ and $x = -\infty$ have to be treated separately.

In particular $x = \infty$ is a limit point if $\forall M > 0 \exists y \in A$ s.t. $y > M$,

and $x = -\infty$ is a limit point if $\forall M > 0 \exists y \in A$ s.t. $y < -M$,

✓

Accumulation point of a set

Let $A \subseteq \mathbb{R}$. Then x is an accumulation point of A if there is a sequence $x_n \in A$ of distinct points $x_n \in A$ such that $x_n \rightarrow x$.

equivalently

$x \in \mathbb{R}$ is an accumulation point if $\forall \epsilon > 0$
 $\exists y \in A$ s.t. $0 < |x - y| < \epsilon$,

$x = \infty$ is an ~~accumulation point~~ $\forall M > 0$

$\exists y \in A$ s.t. $y > M$, and

$x = -\infty$ is an ~~accumulation point~~ $\forall M > 0$

$\exists y \in A$ s.t. $y < -M$.

Each term is defined in 2 ways.
How hard is it to show these definitions are equivalent?

Let $E \subseteq \mathbb{R}$. Define

$$\bar{E} = \{x \in \mathbb{R} : x \text{ is a limit point}\}.$$

The set \bar{E} is called the closure of E .

Equivalent definitions for a set $A \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ to be closed.

$A \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ is closed if $\bar{A} = A$

equivalently,

$A \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ is closed if $\mathbb{R} \setminus A$ is open.

Recall definition of open

$D \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ is open if $\forall x \in D \exists \epsilon > 0$
s.t. $|x - y| < \epsilon$ implies $y \in D$.

Equivalent definitions of $\limsup x_n$

Let $x_n \in \mathbb{R}$ be a sequence. Then

$$\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sup \{x_k : k > n\}$$

equivalently

$$\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = \sup \{x \in \mathbb{R}^+ : x \text{ is a cluster point of } x_n\}$$

Example:

Let $x_n = (-1)^n$. Then

$$y_n = \sup \{x_k : k > n\} = \sup \{1, -1\} = 1$$

so

$$\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} y_n = 1.$$

alternatively we find the set of all cluster points of x_n and take the supremum of this set as follows:

Recall that x_{n_k} is a subsequence if $n_k \in \mathbb{N}$ and $n_k < n_{k+1}$ for all $k \in \mathbb{N}$.

Thus $n_k = 2k$ defines a subsequence and

$$x_{n_k} = (-1)^{n_k} = (-1)^{2k} = 1 \rightarrow 1.00$$

So 1 is a cluster point of x_n .

Similarly, $n_k = 2k+1$ is another subsequence and

$$x_{n_k} = (-1)^{n_k} = (-1)^{2k+1} = -1 \rightarrow -1$$

So -1 is also a cluster point.

Claim there are no other cluster points of this sequence. \square

For contradiction suppose there were a subsequence $x_{n_k} \rightarrow L$ where $L \notin \{-1, 1\}$.

Define

$$\varepsilon = \frac{1}{2} \min\{|L-1|, |L+1|\} > 0$$

and choose $K > 0$ so that $k \geq K$ implies $|x_{n_k} - L| < \varepsilon$.

Case $x_{n_k} = 1$. Then

$$|x_{n_k} - L| = |1 - L| \geq 2\varepsilon$$

contradicts $|x_{n_k} - L| < \varepsilon$. Therefore this case can't happen.

Case $x_{n_k} = -1$. Then

$$|x_{n_k} - L| = |-1 - L| \geq 2\varepsilon$$

is also a contradiction.

Since $x_n = (-1)^n \in \{-1, 1\}$ these are the only cases to consider. Therefore the set of cluster points is $\{-1, 1\}$.

It follows that

$$\begin{aligned}\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n &= \sup \{ x \in \mathbb{R}^* : x \text{ is a cluster} \\ &\quad \text{point of } x_n \} \\ &= \sup \{ -1, 1 \} = 1.\end{aligned}$$

Equivalent definitions of $\liminf x_n$

$$\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \inf \{ x_k : k \geq n \}.$$

Equivalently

$$\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = \inf \{ x \in \mathbb{R}^* : x \text{ is a cluster} \\ \text{point of } x_n \}.$$

Please check all these definitions
and try to show they are
equivalent.